'Velvet Triangles' in Women, Peace and Security Agenda in Indonesia

Nur Azizah
International Relations Department, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia
nurazizah@umy.ac.id

Muhammad Ammar Hidayahtulloh
School of Political Science and International Studies, University of Queensland, Australia
m.hidayatulloh@uq.edu.au

Lintang Cahya Perwita
International Relations Department, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia
lintangcahyaaa@gmail.com

Ali Maksum
International Relations Department, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia
ali.maksum@fisipol.umy.ac.id

Check for updates

Abstrak

Resolusi 1325 tentang Perempuan, Perdamaian dan Keamanan (Agenda WPS) telah diakui sebagai tonggak sejarah dalam upaya global untuk memelihara perdamaian dan keamanan internasional dengan menempatkan perempuan dalam agenda. Indonesia telah menunjukkan komitmennya terhadap Agenda WPS dengan mengadopsi Rencana Aksi Nasional (RAN) pertama pada tahun 2014. Selain itu, Indonesia juga berkomitmen untuk meningkatkan jumlah pasukan perdamaian perempuan dalam misi pemeliharaan perdamaian PBB. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengkaji bagaimana Agenda WPS sebagai kerangka normatif global menyebar dan terinternalisasi di Indonesia. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan feminis institusionalis dan metode kualitatif. Dengan menggunakan konsep 'velvet triangles' (segitiga beludru) oleh Alison Woodward (2004) sebagai kerangka teoritis kami, kami berpendapat bahwa jaringan segitiga aktor beludru – yang terdiri dari birokrat feminis, aktivis organisasi masyarakat sipil, dan pakar gender – memainkan peran penting dalam membuat ruang yang cukup penting untuk penyebaran Agenda WPS dalam politik dalam negeri Indonesia dan perdebatan kebijakan luar negeri. Sebagai penutup artikel, kami mengusulkan dua pertimbangan yang mempertimbangkan pengaturan formal dan informal dari konstelasi beludru dan skala transnasional aktor jaringan untuk memberikan definisi konseptual 'velvet triangles' yang lebih bernuansa.

Kata kunci: Agenda WPS, RAN, penjaga perdamaian wanita, velvet triangles, Indonesia.

Abstract

Resolution 1325 on Women, Peace and Security (WPS Agenda) has been recognized as a landmark in the history of global efforts to maintain international peace and security by centering women on the agenda. Indonesia has shown its commitment to WPS Agenda by adopting its first National Action Plan (NAP) in 2014. On top of that, Indonesia is also committed to increasing the number of female peacekeepers in the UN peacekeeping missions. This research aims to examine how WPS Agenda as a global normative framework diffuses and is internalized in Indonesia. This research employed a feminist institutionalist approach and a qualitative method. Using the concept of 'velvet triangles' by Alison Woodward (2004) as our theoretical framework, we argue that the triangular network of velvet actors—consisting of feminist bureaucrats, civil society organizations' activists, and gender experts—plays a critical role in making a considerably important space for the diffusion of WPS Agenda within Indonesia's domestic politics and foreign policy debates. In concluding the article, we propose two considerations taking into account the formal and informal arrangement of the velvet constellation and the transnational scale of the network's actors to provide a more nuanced conceptual definition of velvet triangles.

Keywords: WPS Agenda, NAP, female peacekeepers, velvet triangles, Indonesia.

INTRODUCTION

Empirical studies have demonstrated the gendered dynamics of armed conflicts and peace processes. Women and men experience the impact of armed conflicts differently as women and girls have been predominantly subjected to sexual violence and rape (Chinkin, 1994; Hynes, 2004). Considering pervasive gender-based

violence in the areas of conflicts, other scholars suggested that women's participation in conflict resolution and peace processes through a global institution such as UN Peacekeeping Operations (UN PKO) was critical to maintain international peace and security (Dharmapuri, 2011; Szymanski, 2016; Azizah, Maksum, & Hidayahtulloh, 2020). Therefore, the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) adopted Resolution 1325 on Women, Peace, and Security (hereinafter: WPS Agenda) in 2000.

The WPS Agenda has been recognized as a landmark in the history of global efforts to maintain international peace and security by centering women on the agenda. The preamble of the resolution explicitly recognizes the disproportionate impacts of violent conflicts on women and children and reasserts the urgency of women's participation in conflict prevention and resolution and peace processes (UNSC, 2000). Following the preamble, global leaders have laid out 18 operative clauses that become the mandates of the WPS Agenda. These mandates range from the urgent need to ensure increased women's representation in decision-making processes at all levels, the incorporation of a gender perspective into peacekeeping operations, to the importance of involving local women and indigenous organizations and focusing on conflict prevention and resolution (UNSC, 2000).

The global diffusion of the WPS Agenda evidenced by the increasing number of National Action Plan on the WPS Agenda across 92 countries (WILPF, 2021) has resulted in the growing number of research aiming for evaluating its national implementation predominantly in African and Global North countries (Horst, 2017; Achilleos-Sarll, 2020; O'Sullivan & Krulišová, 2020; Agius & Mundkur, 2020). Some focused on examining the promotion of the agenda in regional context such as in the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE) and Asia Pacific countries (Davies, 2016; George, 2016; Lee-Koo & Trojanowska, 2017; Myrttinen, Shepherd, & Wright, 2020; Hidayahtulloh, 2020). However, the extensive body of research in this field has paid little attention to examining how a wide range of actors enable this normative global framework to travel transnationally and shape national and even local

strategies for implementing the agenda, especially in relatively peaceful Global South countries.

This article aims to fill the gap in the emerging women, peace, and security scholarship by looking particularly at the creation, adaptation, and implementation of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia. Indonesia adopted its first NAP in 2014. Since then, the diffusion of this global norm has been internalized at the local level through the adoption of Local Action Plans (LAPs) across 15 provinces in Indonesia (AMAN Indonesia, 2021). On the other hand, the Indonesian government has shown its global commitment to increase the number of female peacekeepers. This remarkable progress has led us to think of how the WPS Agenda, as a global norm, travels and diffuses in Indonesia. An overarching research question that we seek to address in this article is how does the global norm diffusion of the WPS Agenda in the Indonesian political landscape take place? In addressing the question, we look at the constellation of actors who conform and promote the WPS Agenda in Indonesia.

In this research, we deeply engage with the 'velvet triangles' concept developed by Alison E. Woodward (2004). Velvet triangles constitute a policy network, of which the actors involved in the network are predominantly women in a male-dominated political landscape. It comprises actors from the organizations of the state, civil society organizations (CSOs), and academia. Using this concept as our theoretical research framework, we argue that the 'velvet triangles' play a critical role in making a considerably important space for the diffusion of the WPS Agenda within Indonesia's domestic politics and foreign policy debates.

This article is divided into four sections. First, we review the existing literature on women, peace, and security and discuss relevant studies on global norm diffusion as the basis of our theoretical understanding. Following this section, we outline the research method, covering data collection and data analysis approach. Third, we present our research findings and discuss our analysis. Our findings discuss two policies representing the national implementation of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia: the inward approach—Indonesia's NAP and

NAP and LAP and the outward approach—a global commitment to enhance female peacekeepers in UN PKO. Then we analyze the constellation of velvet actors in each policy formulation. Lastly, we conclude this article by providing a critical reflection on Woodward's (2004) velvet triangles to open broader academic conversation in this field of research in countries such as Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The creation and implementation of NAP on the WPS Agenda are critical for internalizing this global norm. It can be used to measure to what extent member states are committed to the norm (Shepherd, 2016). Shepherd (2016, p. 325) echoed that:

> "The ownership of the NAP within government will determine its focus (domestic or foreign-policy focused) and level of influence (national women's machinery is typically lacking the resources and political status in many conflict-affected countries to strongly attract genuine political interest and funding)".

Minority world countries (i.e., UK, Australia, Europe) tend to employ an outward-looking approach by promoting the WPS Agenda through their foreign policy. This sort of NAP is formulated by employing elite-centric security politics. Meanwhile, most world countries are more likely to focus on implementing the WPS Agenda in their domestic political context. Women's policy machinery often becomes a key player in the WPS Agenda policy formation.

State institution-driven NAPs, however, are likely to limit the local ownership of the agenda (Basini & Ryan, 2016; O'Sullivan & Krulišová, 2020). An empirical study conducted by Basini and Ryan (2016) depicted that although women's organizations have been meaningfully recognized and engaged throughout the development process of NAPs in Liberia and Sierra Leone (LNAP and SiLNAP, respectively), these two NAPs disserved the hard work and dedication of local women's organizations. The top-down approach in the development of SiLNAP has undermined the knowledge and experience of local women leading to its ineffectiveness in addressing gender-related problems in post-conflict countries (Beoku-Betts, 2016). Another example is evidenced in O'Sullivan and Krulišva's (2020) research on the formulation of Czech NAP. In a gender-hostile environment, such as the Czech government, Czech NAP is a result of a technocratic approach by femocrats who do not pay special attention to gender-related agendas in the country.

Despite the fact that many NAPs were adopted as a result of a top-down approach, some scholars have captured the role of women's organizations as the prominent actor in the drafting of NAPs. Buzzi (2019) discussed the role of women's movements in Myanmar in times of transition. Women League of Burma (WLB), a network of 13 local women's organizations in border areas, has become a significant advocate of the WPS Agenda. Azizah and Hidayahtulloh (2019) also demonstrated the transnational advocacy network built by local women's movements in Myanmar to increase women's representation in decision-making. Women movements' role in the peacebuilding process was also documented in Liberia by Bruey (2018). Having reviewed the existing literature on women, peace, and security, particularly on how UN WPS Agenda is being translated into national policies—either outward- or inward-oriented—and actors involved in the policy formulation, we now turn to a discussion on the theoretical framework used to guide our analysis.

The extensive body of literature has shown that the dispersion of the WPS Agenda globally is understood against what Hernes (1987) termed as 'state feminism', a concept describing the interplay between state institutions and civil societies that works in developing gender equality policies. Consequently, the influential role of academics (scholars in the field of women, peace, and security) has been given little recognition despite their outstanding contribution to the growing number of scholarships in the field, either to defend or to contest the WPS Agenda. As presented before in our introduction, this research focuses on the constellation of three actors who become prominent players in the debate of the WPS Agenda implementation. We assert that gender academic experts have a fundamental role in informing policy formulation.

Woodward's (2004) 'velvet triangles' concept becomes a point of departure for this research.

Velvet triangles, as a concept describing the informal constellation of three main actors (femocrats, women's rights activists, and feminist academics), play a crucial role in the diffusion of global norms pertaining to women's rights and gender equality. The 'velvet' metaphor is used to emphasize the soft fabric of the constellation and its focus on issues of women's rights and gender equality. The network is socially tied by their shared values and norms. The network is used to exchange information across the three actors to bring to the fore the network's policy concerns (in this context, women's policy concerns). Woodward (2004) developed this concept to illustrate triangular networked actors that have led to the introduction of the gender mainstreaming approach in the European Union (EU) equal opportunities policy. In her findings, these three actors are femocrats in the EU Commission and EU parliamentarians with feminist agendas, gender experts, and the established women's organizations in the EU.

For more than a decade since velvet triangles were first conceptualized, Woodward (2015) has reflected how this heuristic concept traveled and transformed across a wide range of multisectoral policy issues. It indicates that the concept was loosely defined when first introduced, allowing it to be used against different contexts. For instance, Guerinna, Chappell, and Wright (2018) examined a feminist triangle in the context of Common Security and Defence Policy (CSDP) in the EU. The examination of this concept in the context of WPS Agenda in Indonesia is highly relevant particularly after a report of ASEAN Regional Study on Women, Peace and Security published in 2021 by ASEAN suggesting that women's contribution to the advancement of WPS Agenda is more likely to take place in informal realm rather than in formal realm.

Against this backdrop, we suggest that the constellation of feminist actors at the three nodes of the triangle (state organizations, CSOs, and academic institutions) would provide a more just explanation to exhibit how the WPS Agenda could be internalized in Indonesia. However, by considering a case study of Indonesia's WPS Agenda, we also provide two recomendations for a more nuanced conceptual definition of velvet triangles.

RESEARCH METHOD

In this research, we employed a Feminist Institutionalist (FI) approach to understand the way in which institutions shape and are shaped by gender. Mackay, Kenny, and Chappell (2010, p. 574) explained that:

"Feminist institutionalism critiques and seeks to overcome the gender blindness of existing scholarship in the field, to include women as actors in the political process, to 'gender' institutionalism, and to move the research agenda toward questions about the interplay between gender and the operation and effect of political institutions".

Using the concept of velvet triangles, we believe that women as political actors—either in political practice or political activism—have the capacity to influence and shape pro-women and gender-sensitive policies.

We collected secondary qualitative data from the existing literature such as books, journal articles, government reports, press releases, credible websites/online communities, and other reliable sources. We gathered texts, pictures, and videos relevant to our research topic from publicly accessible websites. We analyzed the collected data using our theoretical framework. Given this circumstance, we ensured that this research did comply with ethical research considerations.

RESULT AND ANALYSIS

This section discusses two policies that speak to the implementation of the WPS Agenda: Indonesia's National/Local Action Plan (NAP/LAP) and a foreign policy to increase women's participation in UN PKO. To provide a context, the launch of these two policies was under different political regimes. The former was adopted in 2014 under the administration of President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono (SBY). In comparison, the latter was popularized by the Minister of Foreign Affairs Retno Marsudi under President Joko Widodo's administration. Along with the discussion on these two policies, we identified and analyzed triangular networked actors working to advance each policy formation.

INDONESIA'S NATIONAL AND LOCAL ACTION PLANS

Indonesia has shown its full support for the WPS Agenda since its inception in 2000. As an effort to fully implement the WPS Agenda, the Indonesian government adopted the first NAP on WPS in 2014 under the Presidential Regulation No. 18 of 2014 concerning the National Action Plan Protection and Empowerment of Women and Children in Social Conflicts (*Rencana Aksi Nasional Perlindungan dan Pemberdayaan Perempuan dan Anak dalam Konflik Sosial,* hereinafter: RAN P3-AKS). The first Indonesia's NAP (2014-2019), however, was only adopted a decade after UNSC called for member states to formulate their NAPs in 2004. The reasons for the lengthy process of advocating, drafting, and eventually enacting the NAP in Indonesia reflected the political situation within the country, particularly during the post-Soeharto era (*Reformasi*).

The existing legal framework of which the basis for RAN P3-AKS to be developed is Law No. 7 of 2012 concerning Social Conflict Management (*Undang-Undang Penanganan Konflik Sosial,* hereinafter: UU PKS). UU PKS explicitly recognizes the special needs of women and children, particularly pertaining to emergency measures for rescue and protection of victims (Article 32), post-conflict rehabilitation and reconstruction (Article 38 and 39), and women's participation in social conflict resolution at all levels (Article 47, 48 and 49).

However, although UU PKS seems to have accommodated four pillars of the WPS Agenda, its drafting and enactment were not without resistance from human rights activists. Impartial (The Indonesian Human Rights Monitor), for instance, rejected UU PKS, claiming that the legislation betrays *Reformasi*. Al Araf, Director of Impartial (at that time, in 2012), condemned the passage of UU PKS because it allows the involvement of military institutions in 'conflict cessation' (Rastika, 2012). Despite resistance from many human rights activists, the militarization of social conflict remains stipulated in the legislation (see Article 12(d)). In this vein, this research echoes Shepherd's argument (2016, p. 325); UU PKS represents a militarism belief in the WPS Agenda of which states are engaged in "making war safe for women".

The enactment of RAN P3-AKS, however, has been noted as a progressive achievement for Indonesian women. RAN P3-AKS has three primary programs as an effort to implement the WPS Agenda. These three programs are conflict prevention, relief and recovery, and women's empowerment and children participation (Government of Indonesia, 2014). RAN P3-AKS has stipulated budget allocation for the implementation. The program implementation also received funding from international donor and development partners, such as UN Women and Royal Norwegian Embassy (WPS Indonesia, 2020). Significant efforts have been put in place to socialize the NAP to enhance people's awareness and optimize the role of civil society, local government, indigenous communities, faith-based organizations, and local women's initiatives. More importantly, efforts to localize RAN P3-AKS have resulted in tangible outcome, which is the establishment of Local Action Plans in 15 conflict-prone provinces of Sulawesi Tengah, Maluku, Nusa Tenggara Timur, Nusa Tenggara Barat, Lampung, Riau, Yogyakarta, Aceh, Jawa Timur, Sumatera Barat, Kalimantan Barat, Jawa barat, Banten, Papua Barat, and Bali (AMAN Indonesia, 2021; WPS Indonesia, 2020). As the first Indonesia's NAP was completed in 2019, a public national digital consultation to review the implementation of RAN P3-AKS was held online from 20 July – 16 August 2020 at www.wps-indonesia.com in preparation for the creation of the second Indonesia's NAP (2020-2024) (WPS Indonesia, 2020).

Having discussed the context and overview of RAN P3-AKS, we turn to the discussion on 'velvet triangles' in the WPS Agenda in Indonesia. We argue that the adoption of RAN P3-AKS was a product of women's cooperative constellation across three sectors—state institutions, civil society organizations, and academics—that share the same values and beliefs on the importance of women's role in maintaining peace and security. These three velvet actors have significantly contributed to the creation of the first Indonesia's NAP. First, femocrats within the Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection (MoWECP), such

as Minister Linda Amalia Sari (2009-2014) and Minister Yohana Yembise (2014-2019). Second, activists from Asian Muslim Action Network (AMAN) Indonesia, a progressive faith-based organization focusing on gender equality and justice, such as its secretary-general, Ruby Kholifah, leading the WPS Agenda advocacy in Indonesia along with its network organizations. Femocrats and women's rights activists have received outstanding recognition in the scholarship of women, peace, and security as key drivers in adopting and implementing NAPs on the WPS Agenda. The 'velvet triangles' lens allows us to identify the third player in the process of NAP formulation in Indonesia, that is, gender academic experts from research centers such as the Indonesian Institute of Science (LIPI) or Centers for Women/Gender Studies in Indonesian universities. The role of the three actors in the velvet constellation to advocate, formulate, and implement RAN P3-AKS is outlined in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Role of triangular networked actors in RAN P3-AKS

No	Actor	Role
1	Femocrats	MoWECP facilitates spaces for the creation of Indonesia's NAP by involving various stakeholders. Minister Linda and Minister Yohana, by using their bureaucratic mandates, have the capacity to direct the creation and implementation of NAP. It is demonstrated as follows:
		Minister Linda's statement in the opening ceremony of Interfaith Workshop to discuss the 12th draft of Indonesia's NAP in 2010, reads "The resolution is crucial to be implemented as the basis for the protection of women and children in Indonesia who are often victims of conflict" (Gayatri, 2011).
		In a press conference on 23 May 2018, Minister Yohana stated that: "One way to overcome conflict is to establish a task force for the empowerment of women and children at the national level and conflict-prone areas, consisting of prevention, relief and recovery, and women's empowerment and children protection" (ANTARA News, 2018).
2	Feminist activists	AMAN Indonesia plays a leading role in civil society advocacy for creating and implementing Indonesia's NAP. AMAN Indonesia, as a progressive faith-based organization, focuses on gender-sensitive and peace-oriented policy advocacy. Since the adoption of RAN P3-AKS, AMAN Indonesia has become a strategic partner in the government-civil society coalition aiming to assist the process of 'localizing' RAN P3-AKS across 15 conflict-prone areas. For instance, AMAN Indonesia works with local faith-based and women's initiatives like Balai Syura in Aceh (AMAN Indonesia, 2021; Balai Syura, 2021). AMAN Indonesia, supported by MoWECP and other coordinating government ministries, has successfully held a national digital consultation to review the implementation of RAN P3-AKS (2014-2019). The consultation was held online due to the COVID-19 pandemic and attended by 255 participants from all stakeholders. In a welcoming speech available on the consultation's online platform website, Ruby, secretary-general of AMAN Indonesia, stated that "Based on the outcome of the national digital consultation, Indonesia will formulate the second NAP" (WPS Indonesia, 2020). Prior to the consultation, AMAN Indonesia held a

		focused group discussion on 3 February 2020, involving a wide range of participants from MoWECP, local government, women's rights activists, and gender academic experts and consultants to develop monitoring tools of RAN P3-AKS (AMAN Indonesia, 2021).
3	Gender academic experts	Gender academic experts play a key role in providing the network with empirical research findings timely and relevant in Indonesia's domestic politics. Their direct participation in a task force responsible for drafting RAN P3-AKS needs to be recognized in the velvet constellation. While gender experts from LIPI, such as Irene Gayatri—a task force member in drafting RAN P3-AKS (2010-2014), play an essential role at the national level. Researchers from the Centers for Women/Gender Studies in Indonesian universities have the capacity to shape the development of local action plans; for instance, researchers from the Center for Gender Studies of Universitas Syiah Kuala have been involved in formulating Aceh's local action plan (2020-2024) (Balai Syura, 2021). Another example is the role of the Law, Gender, and Society Research Center of Universitas Gadjah Mada in developing the draft of a local action plan in Poso (RAD Perempuan Poso, 2020).

Note. Data adapted from various sources.

Table 1 outlines the role of each actor in velvet triangles to advance the creation and implementation of RAN P3-AKS in Indonesia. These three actors played their role in the constellation of power to formulate pro-women and gender-sensitive policies (Woodward, 2004; 2015). The network has been used as a platform for exchanging information across the actors and influencing those in power to consider the network's concern on the WPS Agenda (Holli, 2008). Femocrats with their mandates can direct their power to provide space for other actors such as civil society organizations and academics in the WPS Agenda debate in Indonesia. Activists from CSOs hold the femocrats' power accountable through their continuous advocacy across Indonesia, particularly in conflict-prone regions. Gender academic experts and consultants have an essential role by providing their expertise to equip the network with empirical research findings to ensure that the policy directed to implement the WPS Agenda is evidence-based and locally relevant. These three velvet actors—femocrats such as Minister Linda and Minister Yohana; feminist activists such as Ruby; and gender experts such as Irene Gayatri—are taking their role in gendering peace and security institutions. In this context, although the diffusion of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia can be seen as a strategic policy of the Indonesian government, the adoption of RAN P3-AKS demonstrates that women concerned in this issue collectively attempt to integrate a gender perspective into the WPS Agenda in Indonesia.

Contextualizing RAN P3-AKS on a broader global trend of NAP on the WPS Agenda, Indonesia's NAP can be considered inward-oriented, focusing on the domestic context of the issue. Even though three velvet actors are involved in creating and implementing RAN P3-AKS, MoWECP as women's policy machinery in Indonesia has a principal role in directing the NAP. In this vein, our findings on RAN P3-AKS corroborate Shepherd's (2016) contention on the dichotomy between majority and minority world countries concerning their approach to the WPS Agenda. It is also evident that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MoFA) is excluded from a national task force to implement RAN P3-AKS. However, the second policy initiative—a foreign policy to increase Indonesian female peacekeepers in UN PKO—illuminates a more outward-looking WPS-related policy. Therefore, in this article a case study of Indonesia's WPS agenda demonstrates a combination of both inward-looking and outward looking approach to WPS agenda that serves

different objectives and is a result of different influences. In the following section, we further discuss Indonesia's foreign policy aiming to increase Indonesian female peacekeepers.

THE WPS AGENDA IN INDONESIA'S FOREIGN POLICY

The Indonesian government, under the President Joko Widodo's administration, has declared the Indonesian Roadmap Vision for 4000 Peacekeepers (2015-2019) (Azizah, Maksum, & Hidayahtulloh, 2020). The Minister of Foreign Affairs Retno Marsudi announced that this roadmap also includes Indonesia's commitment to implement the WPS Agenda by increasing the number of Indonesian female peacekeepers in UN PKO (MoFA, 2019). In the second term of Minister Retno's administration (2019 – present), the WPS Agenda gains more attention in Indonesia's foreign policy agenda. It falls under the fourth priority of Indonesia's foreign policy agenda, increasing Indonesia's contribution and leadership in the region and globally (Marsudi, 2019). Minister Retno has recognized the importance of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's diplomacy by stating that "support for this initiative is inseparable from Indonesia's diplomacy, credibility, and track record in various UN peacekeeping missions, including Indonesian female personnel" (MoFA, The UN Security Council passes Indonesia's resolution on safeguarding world peace for women, 2020).

The integration of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign policy priorities explicitly demonstrates an outward-oriented policy initiative on the WPS Agenda (Shepherd, 2016). In this vein, it is evident that MoFA is the prominent actor in shaping and directing the policy and its implementation. However, what attracts us to contribute to this debate does not focus on evaluating the implementation of Indonesia's commitment to increase female peacekeepers, but rather to investigate how such a foreign policy initiative comes into existence and to what extent the concept of velvet triangles can explain the implementation of WPS Agenda as one of Indonesia's foreign policy priorities.

What we argue here is that the concept of the velvet triangle does not comprehensively explain the adoption of the Indonesian foreign policy to increase the number of Indonesian female peacekeepers in the UN peacekeeping operations. We demonstrate that femorcrats play a prominent role in advancing the agenda without the significant involvement of other velvet actors. However, contextualizing this foreign policy agenda into a broader picture of global politics, we contend that a more nuanced conceptual definition of the velvet triangle is required.

Prajuli, Yustikaningrum, and Amurwanti (2021) suggested that the appointment of Minister Retno as the first female Indonesian foreign minister has influenced gender socialization in MoFA. Her presence has altered the gender dynamics in a male-dominated and masculine state institution. In March 2015, Minister Retno and Minister Yohana signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on the implementation of gender mainstreaming, protection of women and children in Indonesia's foreign affairs and policies (MoWECP, 2016). During the signing of the MoU, formal gender socialization in the foreign affairs department took place. The cooperation between these two ministries has enabled gender mainstreaming in Indonesia's foreign policy agenda. Not only has the promotion of the WPS Agenda in the international community become the mandate of the Indonesian foreign minister, but it also has been carried out by Minister Yohana. MoWECP has also been mandated to coordinate relevant policies and programs for women's empowerment and gender equality at all levels, including in Indonesia's foreign relations, for instance, in Indonesia-Afghanistan peace and security cooperation (MoWECP, 2017).

We notice that the promotion of the WPS Agenda as part of Indonesia's foreign policy priority is further intensified by a series of remarkable events in Indonesia's foreign relations from 2016 to date. First, in September 2016, Indonesia's Vice President Jusuf Kalla announced Indonesia's bid for a non-permanent UNSC membership (2019-2020) (Parameswaran, 2016). Indonesia as "a true partner for world peace" has become a tagline for its campaign to win the bid (Marsudi, 2018). While the

bidding for a non-permanent seat in the UNSC has attracted strategic study scholars to look at the states' national interests, particularly to influence, network, and gain status in global politics (Ekengren, Hjorthen, & Möller, 2020). Indonesia's bid for a non-permanent seat in the UNSC has also attracted gender and politics scholars as it has shaped the focus of Indonesia's peacekeeping diplomacy with a gender component to winning the seat.

Second, Minister Retno received the Agent of Change award from the UN Women and Global Partnership Forum a year later in September 2017 in New York. The award is an appreciation and acknowledgment for her persistent humanitarian work in the region and globally (The Jakarta Post, 2017). She was applauded for her active engagement in Rohingya's humanitarian crisis by many global leaders, indicating her strong leadership and as a role model for Southeast Asian countries (Hidayahtulloh, 2020). She also worked hand in hand with CSOs such as 'Aisyiyah (a women faith-based organization) as an agent of peace through education for women and children in Afghanistan and Mindanao (Suara Muhammadiyah, 2018).

Third, a historic occasion of the first women-only foreign minister meeting was hosted in Canada. It was attended by female foreign ministers from almost 20 countries, including Indonesia (Deif, 2018). The participating female foreign ministers discussed a broad range of issues covering women's participation, elimination of gender-based violence, and conflict prevention and resolution. Besides, the meeting also became an opportunity to engage with civil society, particularly feminist activists (Tsalikis, 2018). Member organizations of Women, Peace and Security Network — Canada (WPSN-C) came together and formed an informal coalition calling for 'concrete and accountable commitment'. The Canadian foreign minister concluded the conference by announcing the initiative of the Canadian government to appoint Canada's first ambassador of women, peace, and security as an effort to effectively implement Canada's NAP on WPS. We observe that the outcome of the meeting serves as the baseline of normative commitment for participating female foreign ministers in implementing the WPS Agenda in their countries. Once they return home, the norm travels and pushes these femocrats to catch up with other countries' commitment to the WPS Agenda and at least to meet the minimum normative commitment (Zwingel, 2012). We identify that the historical women's foreign ministers meeting becomes a new yet influential transnational network of femocrats in defining the future WPS Agenda.

Lastly, on 8 June 2018, Indonesia won the bid for a non-permanent UNSC seat for 2019-2020 (MoFA, 2019). On MoFA's official website, the Indonesian government outlines four priority issues and one special attention issue of Palestine. One of the priority issues is to achieve world peace and sustainable development goals through several strategies, namely increasing the role of women in the peace process, among others. As part of its commitment to advance the WPS Agenda in the Southeast Asian region, Indonesia took the initiative to establish the Southeast Asian Network of Women Peace Negotiators and Mediators (SEANWPNM) in 2019. The objective of the SEANWPNM is to enhance the WPS Agenda in the region (MoFA, 2020). Indonesia concluded its presidency at UNSC by successfully adopting Resolution 2538 (2020) concerning female personnel in UN peacekeeping missions. In her official statement, Minister Retno expressed that:

> "Resolution 2538 (2020) is the first resolution in the history of Indonesian diplomacy in the UNSC. It is also Indonesia's contribution to enhancing the role of women as agents of peace, especially in UN peacekeeping missions" (MoFA, 2020).

These four historical events demonstrate how femocrats play a prominent role in progressing the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign relations. Minister Retno has strategically used her foreign minister position to advance the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign policy. Additionally, the success of Minister Retno in pushing the adoption of Resolution 2538 can be seen as Indonesian femocrats' effort to a gendering of global peace and security institutions. However, the role of Indonesian feminist activists and gender experts appears to be operational rather than instrumental. For instance, 'Aisyiyah has become a strategic partner of the Indonesian

government in implementing the WPS Agenda abroad. Furthermore, the emphasis on the importance of increasing female peacekeepers in UN missions imposed by MoFA is an indication of an elite-centric security politics (Shepherd, 2016). Reflecting on the concept of velvet triangles, it appears that triangular networked actors in the second policy initiative are less evident.

Contextualizing the progress of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign policy to a broader setting of global politics, we suggest that Indonesian femocrats have established a global velvet network with femocrats, and potentially feminist activists and gender experts from other countries, particularly during the first female foreign ministers meeting in Canada in 2018. It indicates how the policy is not unitarily formulated by femocrats in state institutions but rather influenced by a transnational network of femocrats. The works of transnational networks of femocrats interplay with those of transnational civil society organizations advocating the WPS Agenda and think tank groups in this field of research.

In this section, we have demonstrated a relatively contradicting analysis of velvet triangles in forming WPS-related policies. This contradicting analysis might constitute the limitation of this research as we need more data to support our analysis. Nevertheless, assuming our data are sufficient, we contend that the case of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign policy agenda does not speak to the concept of informal velvet constellation among three actors from state departments, CSOs, and academia. However, we identify that the norm of the WPS Agenda as foreign policy agendas travels transnationally (Zwingel, 2012), suggesting how the policy is not unitarily formulated by femocrats in state institutions but rather influenced by a transnational velvet network. The adoption of Resolution 2538 (2020) under Minister Retno's presidency at UNSC might represent, to some extent, the policy outcome of the transnational velvet constellation in shaping the global WPS Agenda.

In the concluding section, we bring together all the threads from our analysis. Taking into account our analysis of RAN P3-AKS and Indonesia's foreign policy to increase Indonesia's female peacekeepers in Indonesia, we suggest working on a new concept of velvet triangles.

CONCLUSION

This article aims to examine the constellation of velvet actors advocating the WPS Agenda in Indonesia. This constellation demonstrates that the NAP formulation is not merely driven by government institutions or the advocacy of civil society organizations alone. It is rather an outcome of triangular networked actors whose members are tied socially by their shared values and norms. We have demonstrated that velvet triangles are evident in formulating the Indonesia's inward-oriented NAP on WPS – RAN P3-AKS (2014-2019). Three prominent actors in shaping the first Indonesia's NAP have been identified, encompassing: 1) femocrats put forward the WPS Agenda in policy debates using their bureaucratic mandates, 2) women's rights activists hold femocrats' power accountable through their continuous advocacy, and 3) gender experts and consultants inform velvet network with the empirical research findings to ensure that the enacted policy is evidence-based and locally relevant. These three actors still work together to formulate the second Indonesia's NAP (2020-2024).

On the other hand, our case study of Indonesia's outward-looking foreign policy initiatives aiming to enhance the number of female peacekeepers in UN PKO does not exemplify Woodward's (2004) concept of velvet triangles. The policy formulation is rather technocratic in nature, discounting the role of CSOs and academics. However, we observe that the transnational network of women's foreign ministers plays a catalyst role in shaping how national femocrats, such as Minister Retno, develop Indonesia's foreign policy on the WPS Agenda. Reflecting our analysis on Woodward's (2004) original concept of velvet triangles, we suggest the need to work toward a new concept of velvet triangles.

Woodward (2015), who first developed the concept, noted how velvet triangles as a heuristic concept have traveled and transformed. By focusing on how the WPS Agenda is internalized and has made a substantial space within Indonesia's domestic politics and foreign policy agendas, this research resonates with Shepherd's critical reflection on the transformation of the concept in the past decade. In the effort to work on a more nuanced concept of velvet triangles, we propose two considerations.

First, although velvet triangles are a descriptor of informal relations among velvet actors (Woodward, 2004), we consider that the network can also be either formal or informal in its organizing. By formal and informal organizing, we meant the process by which these three actors interact and negotiate WPS-related policy is organized, either in a formal or informal setting. It is clear that the shared values on the importance of the WPS Agenda across three velvet actors enable the development of RAN P3-AKS in Indonesia. Nevertheless, the creation of Indonesia's NAP is the outcome of formal organizing across the three actors who work within a task force responsible for drafting RAN P3-AKS. By contrast, national digital consultation to review the implementation of RAN P3-AKS, however, explicitly evidences the informal organizing of the triangular networked actors in preparing the second Indonesia's NAP on the WPS Agenda. In this context, we note that global disruption such as the COVID-19 pandemic has provided a broader space for the public more than ever to promote, shape, and resist the WPS Agenda in Indonesia.

Second, through our analysis of Indonesia's foreign policy on the WPS Agenda, we have identified that the triangle constellation of velvet policy advocates is not necessarily confined within territorial boundaries of states but can also be transnational in terms of its actors and relations. While Woodward (2004) noted, in her case study of EU gender equality policy, that the three actors can work within and across EU member states, Van Eerdewijk and Van der Vleuten (2010) suggested that the concept is too European-centric and fails to recognize the back-and-forth process toward international organizations at the international level. The integration of the WPS Agenda in Indonesia's foreign policy agendas is, in a broader context, shaped by the transnational network of femocrats concerned with the promotion of the WPS Agenda in global politics. In advancing their policy agenda, transnational networks of femocrats intersect with CSOs and think tank groups in advocating women's rights and gender-related policies. To conclude, our two considerations taking into account the formal and informal arrangement of the velvet constellation and the transnational scale of the network's actors would provide a more nuanced conceptual definition of velvet triangles.

REFERENCE

Achilleos-Sarll, C. (2020). 'Seeing' the women, peace and security agenda: Visual (re)productions of WPS in UK Government national action plans. *International Affairs, 96*(6), 1643-1663.

Agius, C., & Mundkur, A. (2020). The Australian foreign policy white paper, gender and conflict prevention: Ties that don't bind. *Australian Journal of International Affairs, 74*(3), 282-300.

AMAN Indonesia. (2021). *Advokasi Kebijakan.* Retrieved from AMAN Indonesia: https://amanindonesia.org/what-we-do/advokasi-kebijakan/

ANTARA News. (2018, May 23). *Menteri PPPA: Perempuan harus jadi agen perdamaian.* Retrieved June 29, 2021, from ANTARA News: https://sumsel.antaranews.com/berita/334527/menteri-pppa-perempuan-harus-jadi-agen-perdamaian

ASEAN, (2021). *ASEAN Regional Study on Women, Peace and Security.* Jakarta: ASEAN Secretariat

Azizah, N., & Hidayahtulloh, M. (2019). Transnational advocacy in increasing women's representation in Myanmar's parliament. *Proceeding of the Third International Conference on Sustainable Innovation 2019 - Humanity, Education and Social Sciences* (pp. 525-537). Atlantis Press.

Azizah, N., Maksum, A., & Hidayahtulloh, M. (2020). Enhancing women contribution in peace, conflict resolution and security agenda: Indonesian female peacekeepers in the United Nations Peacekeeping Operations (Garuda Contingent-KONGA). *Revista UNISCI/UNISCI Journal, 53*, 111-129.

Balai Syura. (2021, April 14). *Urgensi penyusunan rencana aksi daerah perlindungan dan pemberdayaan Perempuan dan Anak dalam konflik sosial di Aceh.* Retrieved June 29, 2021, from Balai Syura: http://balaisyura.com/2021/04/14/urgensi-penyusunan-rencana-aksi-daerah-perlindungan-dan-pemberdayaan-perempuan-dan-anak-dalam-konflik-sosial-di-aceh/

Basini, H., & Ryan, C. (2016). National action plans as an obstacle to meaningful local ownership of UNSCR 1325 in Liberia and Sierra Leone. *International Political Science Review, 37*(3), 390-403.

Beoku-Betts, J. (2016). Holding African states to task on gender and violence: Domesticating UNSCR 1325 in the Sierra Leone national action plan. *Current Sociology, 64*(4), 654-670.

Bruey, V. F. (2018). Redefining women's roles in international and regional law: The case of pre-and post-war peacebuilding in Liberia. In S. Shekhawat (Ed.), *Gender, conflict, peace, and UNSC resolution 1325* (pp. 1-21). Lanham: Lexington Books.

Buzzi, C. (2019). UNSCR 1325 in Myanmar: Women's rights, peace and security in times of transition. In Å. Kolås (Ed.), *Women, peace and security in Myanmar: Between feminism and ethnopolitics* (pp. 18-32). New York: Taylor & Francis Group.

Chinkin, C. (1994). Rape and sexual abuse of women in international law. E*uropean Journal of International Law, 5*(3), 326-341.

Davies, M. (2016). Women and development, not gender and politics: Explaining ASEAN's failure to engage with the women, peace and security agenda. *Contemporary Southeast Asia, 38*(1), 106-127.

Deif, F. (2018, September 20). *Harnessing the power of women foreign ministers.* Retrieved from Human Rights Watch: https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/09/20/harnessing-power -women-foreign-ministers

Dharmapuri, S. (2011). Just add women and stir? *Parameters,* 56-70.

Ekengren, A., Hjorthen, F. D., & Möller, U. (2020). A nonpermanent seat in the United Nations Security Council, *Global Governance: A Review of Multilateralism and International Organizations, 26*(1), 21-45

Gayatri, I. H. (2011, November 30). *Rencana aksi nasional tentang pencegahan, perlindungan dan pemberdayaan perempuan di daerah konflik (RAN P4DK): Upaya mendukung peran perempuan dalam membangun perdamaian di Indonesia.* Retrieved June 30, 2021, from Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Indonesia: http://www.politik.lipi.go.id/:%20http://www .politik.lipi.go.id/en/columns/578-rencana-aksi-nasional-ten tang-pencegahan-perlindungan-dan-pemberdayan-peremp uan-di-daerah-konflik-ran-p4dk-upaya-mendukung-peran -perempuan-dalam-membangun-perdamaian-di-indones

George, N. (2016). Institutionalizing women, peace and security in the Pacific Islands: Gendering the 'architecture of entitlements'? *International Political Science Review, 37*(3), 375-389.

Government of Indonesia. (2014). *National Action Plan on Protection and Empowerment of Women and Children in Social Conflicts.* Jakarta.

Guerrina, R., Chappell, L., & Wright, K. (2018). Transforming CSDP? Feminist triangles and gender regimes. *Journal of Common Market Studies, 56*(5), 1036-1052.

Hernes, H. (1987). *Welfare state and woman power: Essays in state feminism.* Oslo: Norwegian University Press.

Hidayahtulloh, M. (2020, July 2). *The women, peace and security agenda in ASEAN: Progress, gaps and way forward.* Retrieved from Women in International Security: https://ww w.wiisglobal.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/The-Women -Peace-and-Security-Agenda-in-ASEAN-Muhammad-Ammar -Hidayahtulloh.pdf

Horst, C. (2017). Implementing the women, peace and security agenda? Somali debates on women's public roles and political participation. *Journal of Eastern African Studies, 11*(3), 389-407.

Hynes, H. P. (2004). On the battlefield of women's bodies: An overview of the harm of war to women. *Women's Studies in International Forum, 27*(5-6), 431-445.

Institute for Economics & Peace. (2020). *Global Peace Index 2020: Measuring peace in a complex world.* Sydney.

Lee-Koo, K., & Trojanowska, B. (2017). Does the United Nations' women, peace and security speak with, for or to women in the Asia Pacific? The development of national action plans in the Asia Pacific. *Critical Studies on Security, 5*(3), 287-301.

Mackay, F., Kenny, M., & Chappell, L. (2010). New institutionalism through a gender lens: Towards a feminist institutionalism? *International Political Science Review, 31*(5), 573-588.

Marsudi, R. L. (2018, January 11). *Indonesia: Partner for peace, security and prosperity.* Retrieved from The Jakarta Post: https://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2018/01/10/ full-text-indonesia-partner-for-peace-security-prosperity .html

Marsudi, R. L. (2019, October 29). *Penyampaian prioritas politik luar negeri Republik Indonesia 2019-2024.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go.id/portal/id/read /725/pidato/penyampaian-prioritas-politik-luar-negeri- republik-indonesia-2019-2024

MoFA. (2019, January 29). *Indonesia and the United Nations Peacekeeping Mission.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go.id/portal/en/read/91/halaman_list _lainnya/indonesia-and-the-united-nations-peacekeeping -mission

MoFA. (2019, April 8). *Indonesian membership on the UN Security Council.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go.id/portal/en/read/147/halaman_list_lainnya /indonesian-membership-on-the-un-security-council

MoFA. (2020, August 30). *The UN Security Council passes Indonesia's resolution on safeguarding world peace for women.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go.id/bogota/en/news/8249/the-un-security -council-passes-indonesias-resolution-on-safeguarding -world-peace-for-women

MoFA. (2020, August 29). *UN Security Council adopts Indonesia's resolution on female pacekeepers.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go.id/portal/en/read/1632 /berita/un-security-council-adopts-indonesias-resolution-on -female-peacekeepers

MoFA. (2020, December 24). *Indonesia initiates the establishment of the Southeast Asian Network of Women Peace Negotiators and Mediators (SEANWPNM) to advance the agenda of women, peace and security in the region.* Retrieved from Ministry of Foreign Affairs: https://kemlu.go .id/portal/en/read/2019/berita/indonesia-initiates-the-estab lishment-of-the-southeast-asian-network-of-women-peace -negotiators-and-mediators-seanwpnm-to-advance-the- agenda-of-women-peace-and-security-in-the-region

MoWECP. (2016, February 23). *Press release: Optimalisasi PUG, perlindungan perempuan dan anak melalui penyelenggaraan hubungan politik luar negeri.* Retrieved from Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection: https://kemenpppa.go.id/index.php/page/read /29/219/press-release-optimalisasi-pug-perlindungan- perempuan-dan-anak-melalui-penyelenggaraan-hubungan -politik-luar-negeri

MoWECP. (2017, May 17). *Menteri Yohana: Pentingnya peran perempuan sebagai penjaga perdamaian dan juru runding dalam memerangi konflik ketegangan sosial.* Retrieved from Ministry of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection: https://www.kemenpppa.go.id/index.php/page/read/29/ 1421/menteri-yohana-pentingnya-peran-perempuan- sebagai-penjaga-perdamaian-dan-juru-runding-dalam -memerangi-konflik-ketegangan-sosial

Myrttinen, H., Shepherd, L., & Wright, H. (2020). *Implementing*

the women, peace and security agenda in the OSCE region. Vienna: OSCE.

O'Sullivan, M., & Krulišová, K. (2020). "This agenda will never be politically popular": Central Europe's anti-gender mobilization and the Czech Women, Peace and Security agenda. *International Feminist Journal of Politics, 22*(4), 526-549.

Parameswaran, P. (2016, September 27). *Indonesia wants UN Security Council seat.* Retrieved from The Diplomat: https://thediplomat.com/2016/09/indonesia-wants-un-security-council-seat/

Prajuli, W. A., Yustikaningrum, R., & Amurwanti, D. (2021). How gender socialization is improving women's representation in Indonesia's foreign affairs: Breaking the ceiling. *Australian Journal of International Affairs.*

RAD Perempuan Poso. (2020, January). *Konsep kebijakan: Pentingnya penyusunan rencana aksi damai yang berperspektif adil gender di Poso.* Retrieved from Research Center for Law, Gender and Society UGM: https://rispub.law.ugm.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/sites/1049/2020/06/Draft-RAD-perempuan-Damai-Poso-final.pdf

Rastika, I. (2012, April 8). *Imparsial: RUU Konflik Sosial khianati reformasi.* Retrieved June 29, 2021, from Kompas: https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2012/04/08/18285041/Imparsial.RUU.Konflik.Sosial

Shepherd, L. J. (2016). Making war safe for women? National action plans and the militarisation of the women, peace and security agenda. *International Political Science Review, 37*(3), 324-335.

Suara Muhammadiyah. (2018, February 19). *Kementerian Luar Negeri dan 'Aisyiyah kerjasama misi perdamaian.* Retrieved from Suara Muhammadiyah: https://suaramuhammadiyah.id/2018/02/19/kementerian-luar-negeri-dan-aisyiyah-kerjasama-misi-perdamaian/

Szymanski, A. K. (2016). A woman in charge: A civil affairs marine team leader in Afghanistan. In P. G. Tripodi, & K. Frushour (Eds.), *Marines at war: Stories from Afghanistan and Iraq* (pp. 134-150). Quantico: Marine Corps University Press.

The Jakarta Post. (2017, September 27). *Indonesia FM Retno Marsudi receives UN Agend of Change award.* Retrieved from The Jakarta Post: https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/09/21/indonesian-fm-retno-marsudi-receives-un-agent-of-change-award.html

Tsalikis, C. (2018, September 25). *For women foreign ministers and activists, a historic first in Montreal.* Retrieved from Open Canada: https://opencanada.org/women-foreign-ministers-and-activists-historic-first-montreal/

UNSC. (2000, October 31). *Resolution 1325.* Retrieved from S/RES/1325: http://unscr.com/en/resolutions/doc/1325

van Eerdewijk, A., & van der Vleuten, A. (2010). From velvet triangles to velvet pentangles? First steps in a methodological framework for multilevel dynamics of norm diffusion. *Equal is not enough.* Antwerp.

WILPF. (2021, June). *1325 National Action Plans (NAPs).* Retrieved from Women's International League of Peace and Freedom: http://1325naps.peacewomen.org

Woodward, A. E. (2004). Building velvet triangles: gender and informal governance. In T. Christiansen, & S. Piattoni (Eds.), *Informal governanve in the European Union* (pp. 76-93).

Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Woodward, A. E. (2015). Travels, triangles and transformations: Implications for new agendas in gender equality policy. *TVGN, 18*(1), 5-18.

WPS Indonesia. (2020). *Konsultasi Digital Nasional Review RAN P3AKS.* Retrieved from WPS Indonesia:https://wps-indonesia.com

Zwingel, S. (2012). How do norms travel? Theorizing international women's Rights in transnational perspective. *International Studies Quarterly, 56*(1), 115-129.